IN THE ZONE

How enterprise zones have promoted urban sprawl

A charitable person would put the saga of Ohio's enterprise zone program in the realm of unfortunate, unintended consequences. Others would say the results should have been predicted all along. But whether the results were intended or not, it's clear that enterprise zones—special areas in which tax incentives promote economic development—have been little help for economically depressed cities but a boon for prosperous suburbs.

Until now, however, no one ever bothered to go beyond anecdotal evidence and tally up just where the jobs went. In the following story, local freelance writer William Henderson carefully compares the performance of urban and suburban zones in Northeast Ohio.

The lesson of his story is this: it matters where economic development takes place. At the state level, development officials don't see much difference between a job in Solon and a job in Cleveland. But there is a difference. If development strategies abandon our cities, unemployed people, and existing infrastructure, the entire region will be weakened in the long run. It's a matter of regional sustainability and social justice.

By William Henderson

Last July, a slightly reformed version of an existing Ohio law went into effect—a law that, in Northeast Ohio, has had the exact opposite effect of its intended purpose.

The new law is the third renewal and revision of Ohio's "Urban jobs and enterprise zones" legislation. And in its brief history, it provides us with several

Continued on p. 8
Appropriate scale

It's been said that we have federal, state and local governments, but our problems are global, regional and neighborhood. There's a fundamental mismatch of scale.

This mismatch can produce some sad results, such as when individual municipalities in a region compete for economic development and create a sprawl of business. A prime example is the case of suburban enterprise zones, which have promoted the outmigration of tax base and jobs from older urban areas, as our cover story documents this month.

In some cases, we have recognized that we lack governmental institutions at the appropriate scale, and we have created new institutions—typically regional agencies or local nonprofit organizations—to fill the gaps. Thus, we have regional sewer and park districts or metropolitan agencies for transportation planning. And we have learned that some programs, such as housing rehab and weatherization, work best at the neighborhood level where people know and trust each other.

But we have not filled all the gaps. We still lack the ability to address some of the region's most serious problems at the right scale. In the coming months, we will try to identify some of these gaps and suggest what kinds of institutions and citizen organizations we need. (Suggestions welcome!)

Scale is also a major element of urban design. We must, for example, have the right human scale to design pedestrian-friendly streets. Too often, as the article on page 5 points out, we base our designs on the scale of the automobile and turn our streets into hostile territory.

Finally, scale is important in a more abstract way. Metropolitan areas each have a particular feel—from small and confining to big and overwhelming. The mid-sized cities of Northeast Ohio fit nicely in the middle of this scale. They are big enough to be stimulating, yet small enough to allow every one of us to make a difference.

Wish list

We could respond to information requests more easily if we had a photocopier in the EcoCity office. We're looking for a small, easily maintained model that could handle a modest number of copies each month. Donations are tax-deductible.

And don't forget that EcoCity Cleveland subscriptions make great gifts!

Happy holidays,
David Beach
Editor
It may depend on your point of view

One sunny week last August, Northeast Ohio was put under an "ozone watch." Fearing that ozone levels would exceed federal limits, air pollution officials asked area residents to curtail driving, reduce electricity use, and not operate gas-powered lawn mowers or use oil-based paints between noon and 7 p.m., the hot part of the day when volatile organic chemicals in the air are most likely to react with sunlight to form ozone.

There was a sense of urgency to the watch because on two previous days during the summer ozone exceeded limits at an air pollution monitoring site on Cleveland's East Side. Just two more exceedances at that site would bump the Cleveland/Akron/Lorain metropolitan area from a "moderate non-attainment" area for ozone to a "serious non-attainment" area beginning in 1996. Such a redesignation would trigger additional EPA sanctions, such as stricter emission controls that would hamper business expansion, additional vehicle inspection programs or mandatory restrictions on employee commuting.

"Because we're so close to the edge, we hope that the small things people do can really make a difference," John Beeker, director of environmental programs at the Northeast Ohio Areawide Coordinating Agency (NOACA), said at the time. "Besides, it's a good excuse not to cut the grass as often."

Given the well-publicized concern about the potential for becoming an area with "seriously" bad air, it was intriguing to watch state and local officials change their message recently. In November, NOACA requested the U.S. EPA to declare that Northeast Ohio is meeting ozone standards ("in attainment"). Such a redesignation would make it easier for businesses to expand and add new pollution sources. It's a prime economic development goal of the Voinovich administration.

Technically, we do meet the ozone standard set by the Clean Air Act. We've had no violations in the past three years (a violation is more than three exceedances in a three-year period at any one monitoring station). Officials estimate that total hydrocarbon emissions in the region decreased 14 percent between 1990 and 1993. And they believe that ozone levels will stay down because the reductions are the result of permanent and enforceable emission controls, such as stricter tailpipe testing and vapor recovery devices on gas pumps.

So it's almost certain that U.S. EPA will soon be declaring our ozone problem "solved." But not everyone is convinced.

Ozone?

Ozone is a colorless, odorless gas made when volatile organic compounds (such as fumes from industry, gasoline or some paints) and nitrogen oxides react with sunlight. In the upper atmosphere, ozone protects life on earth from harmful ultraviolet rays. But near the ground, ozone is the most harmful constituent of smog. It irritates mucous membranes and causes coughing, choking and impaired breathing.

Keep your engines running: Motorists wait in line to have their cars' emission controls tested. Officials believe vehicle inspection programs have reduced ozone pollution in Northeast Ohio.

The American Lung Association, for example, has challenged the federal ozone standard on the grounds that it does not protect human health. And James Corcoran of the Lung Association's Northern Ohio chapter says it's a mistake to rush and declare Northeast Ohio in attainment until health studies actually show that current ozone levels are safe.

As NOACA's Beeker acknowledged at the agency's November board meeting, depending on your viewpoint, "you can look up at the sky and see it as blue or gray."

Clean air penalty?

One ironic downside to meeting air quality standards is that the region will lose eligibility for millions of dollars in federal Congestion Mitigation/Air Quality (CMAQ) funds. Such funding has been used for new traffic lights, transit projects and bikeways, which are supposed to reduce vehicle emissions. The Northeast Ohio Areawide Coordinating Agency wants the Feds to maintain CMAQ funding for Northeast Ohio even if it is declared to be in attainment for ozone. To help grease the skids, NOACA has authorized spending up to $12,000 for lobbying in Washington.

Ozone monitoring stations in the eight-county region
- Ashtabula County, 770 Lake Rd. in Conneaut
- Cuyahoga County, 390 Fair St. in Berea
- Cuyahoga County, 891 E. 152nd St. in Cleveland
- Cuyahoga County, 6116 Wilson Mills Blvd. in Mayfield
- Lake County, 3040 Lakeshore Blvd. in Eastlake
- Lake County, 71 E. High St. in Painesville
- Lorain County, 131 Court St. in Elyria
- Medina County, 6364 Deerview Lane in Lafayette Twp.
- Portage County, 1570 Ravenna Rd. in Franklin Twp.
- Summit County, 800 Patterson Ave. in Akron
Suburban visions
Frank Lloyd Wright's Broadacre City

By Robert Jaquay

Over the years, I have visited a number of the famous architectural works of Frank Lloyd Wright—the Fallingwater home in Pennsylvania, the prairie houses of Oak Park, Illinois, and the Guggenheim Museum in New York City. And I have come away convinced that Wright's wide critical acclaim is well placed.

But upon visiting the Museum of Modern Art's retrospective of Wright's life work last May in New York, I saw that the architect's influence upon the American landscape was even greater than I had thought. For in the museum's exhibition I encountered "Broadacre City," Wright's 1930s vision for a new way of living through orderly development of America's wide open spaces.

Now I regard Frank Lloyd Wright as more than a design genius. He was also a philosopher and teacher who profoundly influenced the post-World War II era of development—a time when most development has been suburban. Indeed, his thinking about development was more than expansive. It was downright sprawling.

For example, amid the many Wright drawings and models on display stood the 13-foot-square Broadacre Model E of painted wood and cardboard, depicting high-speed freeway access and tightly organized zones for homes, factories, farming, schools, and other uses. It looked very much like the pattern of development seen in aerial photographs of suburban Cuyahoga County.

Wright designed Broadacre City during the Great Depression, well over a decade before construction of the first freeways under the National Defense Highway Act and development of suburban subdivisions accommodating returning GIs and their Baby Boom families. Obviously, Wright's conceptual landscape affected the designs of developers, civil engineers and suburban officials of the 1950s, '60s and on through the present day.

According to the companion book to the exhibit: "Broadacre City was to extend throughout the nation: every man, woman and child deserved to own one acre of ground as long as he or she used it to live on it, and every adult, Wright argued, was entitled to own at least one automobile. According to Wright, the design presupposes that the city is going to the country."

Upon returning to Cleveland, I tracked down Wright's original article, "Broadacre City: A New Community Plan." This work resonates with values and perspectives often heard in local zoning discussions, debates over public transportation investments and the sales pitches of the real estate advertisements.

In particular, Wright's logic has been adopted by many who equate sprawl development with a citizen's "natural right" to live wherever he or she chooses, something Wright called a "democratic value." He wrote that Broadacre is, "A new freedom for living in America. It has thrown the scaffolding [the city] aside. It sets up a new ideal of success."

In theory, Wright's Broadacre was egalitarian. I wonder, however, what his reaction would be to the actual suburban development which has isolated impoverished citizens from not only the affluent, but also from job opportunities and the best schools.

Or would Wright's 1930s ideal of individual freedom through personal automobile be tempered by the reality of 1990s air pollution? Ozone, carbon monoxide, nitrous oxide and particulates are specific pollutants troubling Northeast Ohio attributable to our increasing reliance upon freeway commutes.

In addition to air pollution, the destruction of wetlands, productive farmlands and other natural features has been a consequence of the steady outward push of suburban development. Abandoned stretches of urban brownfields also occur as development consumes outlying Broadacres.

And this visionary architect, who despised petty, wasteful bureaucracy, surely would not have approved of sprawl intensifying local government competition for tax base. Nor would he have liked the expensive replication of local service delivery mechanisms and redundancy in infrastructure systems in the cities and suburbs.

Despite the negative consequences of suburban sprawl and the now apparent flaws of Wright's utopian vision, however, it is still a vision of enormous influence. Those working to advance sustainability and reverse the trends of outmigration and city abandonment need to acknowledge the powerful and continuing effect of Wright's linking suburban living with the most deeply felt values and aspirations of American citizens.

Those working to reverse the trends of city abandonment need to acknowledge the powerful effect of Wright's linking suburban living with the most deeply felt values and aspirations of American citizens.

Bob Jaquay works at the Cuyahoga County Planning Commission.
Creating places for people

The fatal mistake we have been making is to sacrifice every other form of transportation to the private motorcar.

Lewis Mumford,
_The Highway and the City_, 1963

By Kathleen Tark

Sometimes it's not easy to do the right thing. In the field of urban design, for instance, the mistakes of the last 30 years continue to occur even on the drawing boards of architects and planners who have the ability, desire, and knowledge to design environments which are not solely dependent on the automobile.

Whether redeveloping in the inner city, claiming infill sites within existing suburbs, or developing in new growth areas, designers who attempt to create pedestrian-oriented environments face enormous challenges. A complex system of regulatory, economic, and social roadblocks effectively prohibits not only pedestrian-oriented places, but any environment which is not solely automobile-oriented.

It's a serious problem for both suburbs and cities. Not only are new suburbs continuing to be designed to be dependent on the automobile, but new development in existing urban areas is being designed based primarily on suburban models, transforming the pedestrian scale of the inner city into an auto-scaled and auto-dependent environment.

Appropriate scale

Design is based on scale. The scale of measurement used in the design of nearly everything we use in daily life is the human body. Books, computers, kitchen utensils, furniture, cars, clothing, are all the size they are because of the size we are. The city was once designed according to this scale as well. That is one of the reasons we feel comfortable walking in European cities, or in small towns such as Chagrin Falls.

Many of our suburbs and nearly all modern development, on the other hand, are based on the scale of the car. The impact of this on the physical environment is staggering. A person occupies roughly five square feet while standing still or 10 square feet when walking. But a car occupies 350 square feet standing still (including access) and about 1000 square feet while moving (at 30 miles an hour and three car lengths apart). It is no wonder we feel small and at risk on many of our streets which are designed to a scale that is 70 times larger than ourselves.

Making Main Street against the law

Zoning ordinances provide the foundation for auto-scaled development and discourage movement by pedestrians, bicycles and public transportation. Requirements for off-street parking, large setbacks, single-use zoning, and minimum lot sizes separate buildings, and therefore separate people, with the ultimate effect of destroying community life. Citizens and public officials may not realize the physical and social implications of their zoning ordinances: that the reason Main Street no longer exists in new development is because it is against the law.

Large setback requirements, for example, force buildings away from the street edge. In many suburbs a setback of 50 feet or more from the public right of way is not uncommon. The land required for parking, generally a minimum of 1,200 square feet for each 1,000 square feet of building, separates buildings further, discouraging people to walk from building to building as was commonly done in our older towns. Single-use zoning puts the ultimate cap on the problem by segregating homes, stores, workplaces and civic buildings in widely separated areas. Walking is virtually eliminated in such places, for there is no place to walk to, only places to walk in.

Buildings as marketing gimmicks

National chains and retailers create additional concerns. They demand to build in Cleveland the same store that they built in 500 other cities all over the country, a store designed as a marketing gimmick rather than a piece of architecture which becomes a building block of a community. Besides imposing a visual blight on our landscape, these chain stores close themselves off to the street. A bare minimum of clear glass is used; the remainder must be spandrel (opaque glass) to allow more blank walls for shelf space inside. Thus, the shopfront window, which in the past encouraged pedestrian movement and put eyes on the street to help guard our neighborhoods, has been discarded to the detriment of the security of our communities.

The chains also bring excessive parking demands with them. Some restaurateurs demand off-street parking of 18 cars per 1,000 square feet of store, over five times the

Continued on the next page

Good and bad places for pedestrians:

A McDonald's on Lee Road in Cleveland Heights (left) holds the street edge and has parking in back. A convenience store on Lorain Road in Cleveland, on the other hand, punches a hole in the surrounding commercial strip and sits behind an ugly expanse of asphalt.
minimum zoning code requirement. Shared parking with other uses is generally not desired.

Developers who build for these national chains and retailers must meet their demands. Even developers with a great deal of vision and a wealth of good intentions see the creation of pedestrian-oriented environments as risky. Banks will loan money more easily to the sea-of-parking-fronting-a-strip-mall formula of development. Any integration of other uses which would reduce the dominance of the automobile in the development is considered unorthodox.

**Streets for cars**
Traffic engineering standards also prevent the creation of democratic streets due to their single-minded focus on the automobile. Turning radii are increased so cars can turn at greater speeds, many times doubling or tripling the amount of dangerous pavement pedestrians must cross.

Stately boulevards—such as the Champs-Elysees or the Avenue Montaigne in Paris, which create shared street space for slow traffic, bicycles, and pedestrians by dividing express from local traffic—are against current traffic engineering standards, even though these streets accommodate thousands of cars each day. Fairmount Boulevard, one of the most beloved streets in Greater Cleveland, could not be designed today according to current standards. Today's required version of Fairmount would be a chopped suety of grass, curb, and pavement, cut with turning lanes double the size required by traffic engineering consultants. The transportation agencies that impose these standards do not necessarily have bad motives, just an imbalanced viewpoint. Instead of being agencies of transportation, they are agencies of the private automobile.

**Social costs**
What sort of social costs are we taking on by discouraging public transportation and walkable neighborhoods? Politicians lament the loss of community, yet unknowingly discourage the formation of community through government regulations. After all, how can community be formed when people do not meet or pass on the street but only see each other through windshields at 30 miles an hour?

It is possible to design to a human scale in modern development while still accommodating the automobile by integrating pedestrian, bicycle, and public transportation needs into new development schemes. A multitude of examples can be found in other countries, such as the Netherlands and Germany.

A more balanced view of transportation, however, must first infiltrate our city planning commissions, zoning boards and transportation agencies. Rather than minimum parking standards, we need maximum parking standards, as well as incentives for shared parking between stores to reduce the vast, alienating spaces created by parking lots. To encourage alternate forms of transportation, we must give them comparable treatment in our zoning ordinances—provisions for the parking of bicycles and pedestrian connections between buildings and through parking lots. Single-use zoning should be replaced by planned-unit development, districts which allow a true mixture of residences, shops, services, and places of work. Shopfront windows for retail uses should be required at the street edge. Land use and transportation planning must be integrated so as not to repeat the mistakes of our past.

Urban theorist Lewis Mumford wrote 30 years ago:

> When the American people through their Congress voted a little while ago (1957) for a 26 billion dollar highway program, the most charitable thing to assume about this action is that they hadn't the faintest notion of what they were doing. Within the next 15 years they will doubtless find out; but by that time it will be too late to correct all the damage to our cities and our countryside, not least to the efficient organization of industry and transportation, that this ill-conceived and preposterously unbalanced program will have wrought.

Is it too late to start planning differently? Many developers are taking interest in Cleveland neighborhoods, which hold vast tracts of land ripe for redevelopment, as well as people in need of new homes, services, and workplaces. Let us work to restore balance in our urban designs so that at least in new development, our streets may be safer, our quality of life may improve, our elderly and children may be more independent, and the sense of community may be restored to our neighborhoods.

Kathleen Tark is an architect and urban planner with the firm of City Architecture in Cleveland.
Investing in Ohio through energy efficiency

Imagine this. Ohio could cut its total energy bill by 26 percent by the year 2010, create a more competitive economy with thousands of new jobs, and clean up the environment.

According to a study released recently by the Campaign for an Energy Efficient Ohio, all this could happen if the state abandons its coal-driven energy policies of the past and embraces energy efficiency and renewable resources. Specifically, the study finds:

- In 1992, the average Ohioan consumed an amount of energy equivalent to 2,711 gallons of gasoline (339 million Btus per capita) for all uses. This is about five percent greater than for the United States as a whole.
- An investment of $28 billion in cost-effective, energy-saving technologies in the next 16 years would yield a cumulative energy bill savings of $51 billion over the same period.
- The investments in energy efficiency technologies would increase employment in the state by 63,000 jobs, the equivalent of 400 small manufacturing plants.
- Environmental benefits would include a reduction in energy-related carbon emissions (which cause global warming) by about 22.5 million metric tons in the year 2010.

The study concludes: "...energy that is inefficiently or inappropriately used can constrain the economic activity of a state and thereby limit the job creation process. With abundant opportunities for energy efficiency improvements as well as the development of renewable resources and alternative motor fuels, Ohio is seemingly well-positioned to move from a heavy reliance on coal and nuclear fuels towards a more sustainable energy future."

The biggest obstacle to achieving this desirable future, the study admits, will be coming up the $28 billion investment. It will require redirecting about eight percent of Ohio's annual energy bill away from conventional energy sources and towards energy efficiency technologies. And that will require changes in state and federal energy policies to favor energy efficiency.

The Campaign for an Energy Efficient Ohio, which is working to overcome such hurdles, is a joint effort by the Ohio Environmental Council, Safe Energy Communication Council and the Center for Clean Air Policy. The study was prepared by Skip Laitner of the American Council for an Energy-Efficient Economy.

For more information, call (614) 224-4900.

Cleveland buildings retrofit for energy savings

At a November 14 press conference, the Campaign for an Energy Efficient Ohio recognized two downtown Cleveland office buildings for successful energy efficiency programs:

- The Lausche State Office Building on Superior Avenue West has reduced its electric bill by $90,000 a year since beginning an energy management program in 1991. Some of the lighting system was retrofitted with new lamps and ballasts, the heating/ventilation/air conditioning controls and fan motors were upgraded, the building perimeter and entry doors were made more weather tight, and water pumps were rebuilt. Future retrofits will reduce utility costs by $350,000 a year by the end of 1995. The building is one of 24 in the nation to be designated an "Energy Star Showcase Building" by the EPA.

- The National City Bank Building at E. 9th and Euclid Avenue installed more efficient fluorescent light ballasts and bulbs. The retrofit cost $100,000 but is expected to save the bank $59,000 a year in lighting costs for a quick pay-back. The cooler bulbs used will also reduce air conditioning costs by 10 percent.

Centerior backs away from conservation commitment

Energy efficiency and conservation may make sense for the rest of us, but apparently not for Centerior Energy. The local utility recently asked the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio (PUCO) to allow it to cancel most of its programs to help customers reduce electricity use. The utility was required to invest about $35 million in residential, commercial and industrial energy conservation programs as a result of intervention by the Ohio Sierra Club, city of Cleveland and consumer groups (see our June 1993 issue on the Centerior Collaborative).

Centerior is allowed to cut its conservation programs if the utility can prove they aren't cost-effective. Sierra Club energy activist Ned Ford believes many of the programs are working but that the PUCO has not allowed the financially-distressed utility to recover costs in a timely manner.

"The current rate structure creates disincentives for companies to work in their own customers' interest," Ford said.
In the zone
From p. 1

hard-to-swallow lessons about business, government and the possible fate of our urban centers.

A product of the '80s
Initially enacted in 1982, the original legislation was, like many new laws, a product of the times. During the early '80s, Ohio was in the grips of a recession. Statewide unemployment hovered at 12 percent, and manufacturing centers such as Cleveland, Warren, and Toledo were hemorrhaging jobs. At the same time, the newly elected Reagan administration was dramatically cutting aid to central cities in an effort to reduce the federal deficit and finance new defense spending.

Faced with a deepening recession and dwindling financial resources, legislators in Columbus mobilized to pass legislation that could create jobs in areas of serious economic decline without committing additional state funds. According to literature produced by the Ohio Department of Development in 1982, "Enterprise zones may be defined as depressed areas in which governments provide special tax incentives and perhaps other incentives in order to promote job creation and economic development."

The special tax incentives were abatements of city and county property taxes that local legislatures could grant to businesses that located or created jobs in distressed areas. Although experts debate how much tax breaks influence corporate location decisions, enterprise zones did give local governments another economic development tool. Eligibility for the zones was based primarily on levels of unemployment, poverty, population decline, and abandoned structures.

When the original enterprise zone law expired at the end of 1987 there had been only modest statewide activity, with 128 total abatements. Most depressed cities found it difficult to give tax breaks to businesses when most of the abated taxes had to be foregone by local schools. When abatements were granted, they were often for investments in facilities already in enterprise zones and were meant to ensure a company's long-term presence.

A prominent example of this was the first phase of LTV Steel's renovations in Cleveland. According to state records, LTV received a 10-year, 100-percent abatement on $37 million worth of capital improvements. In the process, only six jobs were created, but 943 were retained.

Come out to Solon: The enterprise zone in Solon has helped to attract more than 2,400 jobs to a suburb of just 18,548 people.

Diluted intent
When the enterprise zone legislation was renewed at end of 1987, rural and suburban lawmakers successfully diluted the distress criteria in order to qualify their own communities. Having "vacant or undeveloped land" now became equally as important as being on the federal list of "impacted cities." By 1989, any county with a population of less than 300,000 also qualified as a "rural enterprise zone" by suffering no hardship other than having undeveloped land. Under this criteria, all but seven of Ohio's 88 counties qualified.

Not surprisingly, enterprise zone activity surged dramatically. Today there are more than 200 enterprise zones in the state. In Northeast Ohio, growing and affluent communities such as Solon, Highland Heights, Twinsburg, and Avon Lake deftly qualified as enterprise zones and competed head-to-head for an industrial tax base with cities like Cleveland and Lorain. With improved access provided by recently constructed freeways and an abundance of "greenfield" building sites, the outlying suburbs were the predictable winners. And very quickly, enterprise zone activity began to mirror the business patterns of Greater Cleveland in general: companies were

Continued on p. 10
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>COUNTY</th>
<th>CITY</th>
<th>POPULATION 1990</th>
<th>POPULATION 1970-90</th>
<th>$ INVESTED PER CAPITA</th>
<th>JOBS GAINED PER 1000 POP</th>
<th>JOBS GAINED PER 1000 POP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CUYAHOGA</td>
<td>CUYAHOGA</td>
<td>1,412,140</td>
<td>-18.0%</td>
<td>2,661,750</td>
<td>3,458</td>
<td>4.85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>BEREA</td>
<td>19,051</td>
<td>-14.9%</td>
<td>18,373</td>
<td>965</td>
<td>8.92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>BROOKPARK</td>
<td>22,865</td>
<td>-25.5%</td>
<td>658,200</td>
<td>28,766</td>
<td>30.61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>CUYAHOGA HTS.</td>
<td>682</td>
<td>-21.2%</td>
<td>411,550</td>
<td>603,446</td>
<td>39.59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>EUCLID</td>
<td>54,875</td>
<td>-23.3%</td>
<td>142,712</td>
<td>2,601</td>
<td>31.33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>GARFIELD HTS.</td>
<td>31,739</td>
<td>-23.4%</td>
<td>12,529</td>
<td>395</td>
<td>4.83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>HIGHLAND HTS.</td>
<td>6,249</td>
<td>5.5%</td>
<td>ENTERPRISE ZONE AFTER 1991</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>PARMA/CLEVE</td>
<td>87,876</td>
<td>-12.3%</td>
<td>406,970</td>
<td>4,631</td>
<td>5.86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>MAPLE HTS.</td>
<td>27,089</td>
<td>-20.4%</td>
<td>7,812</td>
<td>288</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>VALLEY VIEW</td>
<td>2,137</td>
<td>50.3%</td>
<td>15,585</td>
<td>7,293</td>
<td>49.13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>MAYFIELD HTS.</td>
<td>19,847</td>
<td>-10.1%</td>
<td>ENTERPRISE ZONE AFTER 1991</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>NORTH OLMSTED</td>
<td>34,204</td>
<td>-1.9%</td>
<td>ENTERPRISE ZONE AFTER 1991</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SOLON</td>
<td>18,548</td>
<td>60.3%</td>
<td>114,083</td>
<td>6,151</td>
<td>131.87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>OAKWOOD</td>
<td>3,392</td>
<td>8.5%</td>
<td>28,670</td>
<td>8,452</td>
<td>98.47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>BEDFORD</td>
<td>14,822</td>
<td>-15.7%</td>
<td>ENTERPRISE ZONE AFTER 1991</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>BEDFORD HTS.</td>
<td>12,131</td>
<td>-7.1%</td>
<td>36,093</td>
<td>2,975</td>
<td>7.83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>CLEVELAND</td>
<td>505,816</td>
<td>-32.7%</td>
<td>809,173</td>
<td>1,600</td>
<td>299</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LAKE</td>
<td>MENTOR</td>
<td>47,351</td>
<td>28.7%</td>
<td>136,563</td>
<td>2,684</td>
<td>19.22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>FAIRPORT HARBOR</td>
<td>2,978</td>
<td>-18.4%</td>
<td>952</td>
<td>320</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>PERRY &amp; PERRY TWP.</td>
<td>5,956</td>
<td>-12.2%</td>
<td>251</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>1.69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>PAINESVILLE</td>
<td>15,699</td>
<td>-5.2%</td>
<td>1,542</td>
<td>124</td>
<td>8.41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>MADISON/MAD. TWP.</td>
<td>17,954</td>
<td>27.0%</td>
<td>2,800</td>
<td>146</td>
<td>5.65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>EASTLAKE</td>
<td>21,161</td>
<td>7.4%</td>
<td>12,445</td>
<td>588</td>
<td>10.64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>WICKLIFFE</td>
<td>14,558</td>
<td>-31.6%</td>
<td>86,485</td>
<td>5,841</td>
<td>27.13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LORAIN</td>
<td>AVON</td>
<td>7,337</td>
<td>3.4%</td>
<td>16,382</td>
<td>2,233</td>
<td>3.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>AVON LAKE</td>
<td>15,066</td>
<td>24.5%</td>
<td>713,000</td>
<td>47,325</td>
<td>86.29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SHEFFIELD</td>
<td>1,943</td>
<td>12.3%</td>
<td>475</td>
<td>244</td>
<td>13.90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SHEFFIELD LAKE</td>
<td>9,825</td>
<td>18.1%</td>
<td>7,050</td>
<td>718</td>
<td>2.54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ELYRIA</td>
<td>56,746</td>
<td>5.8%</td>
<td>379,952</td>
<td>6,696</td>
<td>16.34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>GRAFTON</td>
<td>3,344</td>
<td>29.4%</td>
<td>1,120</td>
<td>335</td>
<td>10.29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>LAGRANGE</td>
<td>1,199</td>
<td>11.6%</td>
<td>1,055</td>
<td>880</td>
<td>40.03</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>LORAIN</td>
<td>71,245</td>
<td>-9.3%</td>
<td>579,183</td>
<td>8,129</td>
<td>1.70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>N. RIDGEVILLE</td>
<td>21,564</td>
<td>65.2%</td>
<td>43,280</td>
<td>2,007</td>
<td>3.99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>WELLINGTON</td>
<td>4,140</td>
<td>0.1%</td>
<td>15,338</td>
<td>3,705</td>
<td>37.68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MEDINA</td>
<td>MEDINA</td>
<td>122,354</td>
<td>47.9%</td>
<td>ENTERPRISE ZONES AFTER 1991</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>BRUNSWICK</td>
<td>19,231</td>
<td>76.2%</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>PORTAGE</td>
<td>28,230</td>
<td>78.1%</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>AURORA</td>
<td>142,585</td>
<td>13.3%</td>
<td>102,308</td>
<td>718</td>
<td>8.33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>GARRETTVILLE</td>
<td>9,192</td>
<td>40.4%</td>
<td>81,188</td>
<td>8,832</td>
<td>89.10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>VLG. OF MOGADORE</td>
<td>2,014</td>
<td>17.2%</td>
<td>4,000</td>
<td>1,966</td>
<td>35.25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>RAVENNA</td>
<td>4,008</td>
<td>4.1%</td>
<td>14,465</td>
<td>3,617</td>
<td>63.87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SUMMIT</td>
<td>ACRON (NO EZs)</td>
<td>514,990</td>
<td>-6.9%</td>
<td>289,191</td>
<td>3,606</td>
<td>5.84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>BARBERTON</td>
<td>223,019</td>
<td>-19.0%</td>
<td>137,724</td>
<td>497</td>
<td>7.64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>HUDDLESTOWN</td>
<td>11,569</td>
<td>168.2%</td>
<td>39,672</td>
<td>3,606</td>
<td>37.18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>MACEDONIA</td>
<td>7,509</td>
<td>20.0%</td>
<td>31,665</td>
<td>4,218</td>
<td>49.27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>TWINSBURG</td>
<td>9,808</td>
<td>51.3%</td>
<td>45,769</td>
<td>4,765</td>
<td>72.35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>TWINSBURG TWP.</td>
<td>898</td>
<td>-36.7%</td>
<td>143,977</td>
<td>160,689</td>
<td>1,148.44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>VLG. OF MOGADORE</td>
<td>4,008</td>
<td>4.1%</td>
<td>14,485</td>
<td>3,617</td>
<td>63.87</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Construction of 1,480 contributed to Population loss.

This table compares the records of communities with enterprise zones in Northeast Ohio, showing that prosperous suburbs have outgained central cities. Solon, for example, gained about 132 jobs per 1,000 residents, while Cleveland gained less than one job per 1,000 residents.

Analysis by William Henderson, based on enterprise zone data from the Ohio Department of Development through 1991.

EcoCity Cleveland O December 1994
From p. 8

moving out of Cleveland and its inner-ring suburbs to the "edge cities" of outer Cuyahoga and bordering counties.

Western Reserve Zone

Of the suburban enterprise zones, probably the most vigorous in Northeast Ohio was the Western Reserve Zone. Located along I-480 in northern Summit County, this zone encompasses several communities, including Twinsburg, Twinsburg Township, Macedonia, and Hudson Township. According to demographers, this area is one of the most prosperous in the Cleveland-Akron metropolitan area. Yet, by carefully packaging its census tracts to exclude new developments, the Western Reserve Zone managed to qualify much of its undeveloped portions as "distressed."

According to Summit County documents, by early 1994 the Western Reserve Zone had made 92 agreements; of these, 32 were made with businesses relocating from Cleveland or Cuyahoga County. Although its population base was relatively small—only 5,789 residents—total new employment within the Western Reserve Zone exceeded 5,200 jobs. During the same period, the five enterprise zones in the city of Cleveland generated only 27 total agreements and 1,037 new jobs.

With growing evidence of intra-regional movement to high-growth areas, a committee of Summit County officials was formed to study the issue. Their 1991 report concluded that "... drastic changes need to be made ... in the enterprise zone program or that it needs to be entirely revoked. As long as the program exists in its present form, however, Summit County must continue to participate in it. Although there is a public policy loss to Ohio when abatement is used in intercounty (intra-state) competition for businesses, there is a gain for Summit County when it is successful in such competition."

Where the jobs went

When the enterprise zone law was set to expire at the end of 1992, a large coalition in the General Assembly attempted to reform it. In order to better study its effects, the law was renewed for the year 1993. Supporters including Governor George Voinovich and the Ohio Department of Development (ODOD) vigorously defended the law as a necessary tool to compete with neighboring states such as Indiana and Kentucky.

Yet, in spite of their position, the Ohio Department of Development never documented how many of the 1400-plus enterprise zone agreements attracted out-of-state businesses. Moreover, due to the poor reporting requirements of the old law, the Ohio Department of Development had no data on the extent or pattern of intra-state movement.

The last ODOD report on enterprise zones was actually done in early 1992. At that time, enterprise zones were credited with generating $13 billion dollars worth of investment and over 43,000 new jobs. Although the ODOD calculated these figures on a statewide basis, they never totalled them by regions or zones.

Using the statewide listing of enterprise zone agreements that accompanied the 1992 report, this writer separated out the data for the Cleveland-Akron area and discovered some startling trends:

- The number of new jobs attributed to enterprise zones has been significantly overstated. In 1989, for example, a Maple Heights company moved to Aurora, receiving a 10-year, 90 percent abatement. Yet, according to state records, all of the 650 relocated employees were counted as jobs created. This pattern is repeated with companies that moved from Cuyahoga Heights to Solon, Beachwood to Hudson Township, Cleveland to Twinsburg, and many others.

- The state's listing of jobs "retained" also masked intra-regional movement. A Valley View company that retained 312 employees actually moved them from Cleveland. Similar accounting was found with companies moving from Elyria to North Ridgeville, Painesville to Mentor, and Bedford to Solon, among others.

- Although enterprise zones were intended to favor areas of declining population, the employment gains have generally been in high growth areas. Mentor's population increased 29 percent from 1970 to 1990 while it gained 1,222 enterprise zone jobs. During the same time period, Solon gained 2,446 jobs (37 percent of the total in Cuyahoga County) while experiencing a 60-percent jump in population. Likewise, Avon Lake grew by 24 percent and gained 1,300 new jobs.

- The oldest enterprise zone in Northeast Ohio, and arguably the poorest, is Cleveland's zone #1 covering the Central, Hough, and Fairfax neighborhoods. Through the end of 1991, it had garnered no enterprise zone investment and created no jobs.

Draining the central cities

To date, Ohio's enterprise zone law has been a drain on the city of Cleveland. Although the city has managed to gain some new investment and jobs through the program, it has seen a much larger number of jobs and capital leave for suburban zones.

Moreover, when a large number of jobs are relocated to edge cities along the area's freeways, traffic patterns are dramatically changed and commuters have less incentive to live in Cleveland or its inner-ring suburbs. Census data already confirm this trend.

To the extent that Ohio enterprise zones provide incentives to employers to leave central cities, they are actually subsidizing urban sprawl. By spreading out the employment base and making regional transit more impractical and inefficient, the state is also increasing the need for more roads while the existing infrastructure deteriorates. The swath of urban decay is also widened as older cities and inner suburbs are unable to maintain services and schools due to eroding tax bases.

By 1989, any county with a population of less than 300,000 also qualified as a "rural enterprise zone" by suffering no hardship other than having undeveloped land.
As a tool for state competition, enterprise zones have been a blunt instrument. Only a handful of Northeast Ohio's enterprise zones have attracted out-of-state employers. In the meantime, affluent communities have too often benefited at the expense of those that are actually "distressed."

Reforms with loopholes
The latest version of Ohio's enterprise zone law, passed this year, represents a compromise between supporters of the old law and its critics. Limits on abatements will drop from 100 to 75 percent. Abatements for retail stores will be sharply curtailed. Local school boards will also be granted some revenue from new income taxes and will be guaranteed input in the abatement decision process.

Nevertheless, the state's distress guidelines remain lenient and subject to gerrymandering. Areas that don't qualify as "distressed" can still qualify under a new type of limited enterprise zone that has no criteria at all. Under the new rules, a Cleveland company that has outgrown its facility can relocate to a limited enterprise zone by petitioning the director of the ODOD. Yet, room for expansion is one of the most common reasons why companies move to "greenfields." Once again, cities like Cleveland are being placed at a competitive disadvantage.

Ultimately, this siphoning of jobs and investment will weaken the region as a whole. Although many of us live in towns and suburbs, we all depend on the region's urban centers to sustain our quality of life. And we cannot escape the social and economic problems left behind in the cities by outmigration to the suburbs.

For everyone's benefit, then, our public policies must work with cities like Cleveland and Akron, not at their expense.

Ohio enterprise zone highlights

1981: Ohio is in the grips of a recession, and the Reagan administration is slashing aid to cities. Legislators in Columbus mobilize to pass legislation that could create jobs in depressed urban centers without committing additional state funds.

1982: The Ohio Department of Development produces literature describing the new enterprise zones as "..depressed areas in which governments provide special tax incentives...to promote job creation and economic development." Eligibility is based on levels of unemployment, poverty, population decline, and abandoned structures.

1987: In a revised law, legislators add "vacant and undeveloped land" as an acceptable distress criteria. Counties with fewer than 150,000 residents also become eligible as "rural enterprise zones." Many greenfields now qualify for abatements.

1989: The definition of "rural enterprise zones" is changed to include counties of 300,000 persons or less; all but seven of Ohio's 88 counties are now eligible as rural enterprise zones. Enterprise zone activity explodes with investment patterns sharply resembling the outflow of jobs and capital from central cities. The data to verify this trend are conspicuously absent.

1991: Despite substantial evidence that Macedonia, Twinsburg, and Hudson Township have all become large magnets for enterprise zone activity, the Summit County Enterprise Zone Committee is sharply critical of intra-regional movement. Their report concludes that "...drastic changes need to be made by the Ohio Legislature in the enterprise zone program or it should be revoked entirely."

1992: The ODOD produces the 1991 Ohio Enterprise Zone Program Report, which is mandated by state law. The report is confined to glowing aggregate numbers, however, and none of the data are separated by region or zone. The report fails to document how many out-of-state companies the zones have attracted, overstates the number of new jobs created, masks job movements within regions. Despite its limited usefulness, the 1991 Program Report is the last piece of data the ODOD will produce before a "computer switch-over" effectively cripples its database.

1992: Ohio's enterprise zone law is scheduled to expire at the end of the year. The ODOD, Governor Voinovich, and several state legislators openly fret that Ohio will soon become uncompetitive with other states. Pertinent data is still unavailable and the law is renewed for one year to permit further study.

1993 THROUGH THE WINTER OF 1994: When confronted with the idea that enterprise zones should again be restricted to depressed urban areas, ODOD Director Dan Jakeway utter's his most memorable—and regrettable—quote: "You're assuming [companies] will go into Cleveland, Akron. It's a wrong assumption. It won't happen." In early January the law is extended for six more months.

MARCH 1994: Rep. Dan Troy thinks he has the votes to pass a bona fide reform measure in the House. The Governor and ODOD continue their lobbying blitz, and several House members from prosperous districts are afraid they will lose their enterprise zones. Sensitive to their concerns, Speaker of the House Vern Riffe halts a floor vote until a less aggressive reform package can be hammered out. A compromise measure passes on March 31.

MAY 1994: Summit County releases comprehensive data on its enterprise zones. The Western Reserve Zone, covering Hudson, Macedonia and Twinsburg, has added 5,239 new jobs since its inception, or 88 percent of the total county gain. Of the 92 agreements in the Western Reserve Zone, 32 are given to companies from Cleveland or Cuyahoga County. During the same period, Cleveland's five enterprise zones generate only 27 agreements and 1,037 new jobs.

JUNE 1994: ODOD is inundated with abatement requests prior to the sunset of the old law. Professor Ned Hill of the College of Urban Affairs at Cleveland State University releases a report on the new enterprise zone law. Although he concedes that small steps were taken to rein in intrastate competition, "...a good-sized factory can be driven through a prominent loophole."
A wish list for RTA

A subscriber and frequent rider of the Greater Cleveland Regional Transit Authority (RTA) recently sent in the following wish list for a better transit system:

- Insist that every RTA employee commute to work on RTA as a measure of the system’s efficiency.
- Create a legible and comprehensive system map with bus routes color-coded for different parts of the region (e.g., western suburbs red, eastern suburbs green, etc.). Post the map and schedules at all major pick-up points.
- Use two fleets of bus vehicles to facilitate more frequent service—small, fuel-efficient vans to provide more frequent service for non-rush hour or late night service and larger buses for busy routes and rush hour express service.
- Use more consistent design elements (lighting, benches, signage and other fixtures) at bus and rail stations so that everyone will be able to recognize the system.
- Provide security, seating, shelter from the elements and heat at all rail stations and major bus transfer points.
- Follow through with the proposal in RTA’s long-range plan to create community transit centers at major stops and transfer sites. Provide 24-hour coffee shops and restaurants so passengers will have pleasant, safe places to wait.
- Develop a central downtown bus station for transfer passengers—a real bus station, not the pathetic RTA shop that is poorly situated at Prospect and W. 3rd Street and closes at 5 p.m. It would have been nice to give bus passengers the same design considerations given to rail passengers during the reconstruction of Tower City, but now that is too late. RTA could at least create a waiting area, perhaps by taking over a vacant storefront elsewhere along Prospect Avenue, so bus riders don’t have to humiliate themselves waiting outside the Sfuzzi Restaurant in the rain and snow.
- Consolidate the E. 120th Street and Cedar Road Rapid stations into one highly visible station at Mayfield Road to serve University Circle institutions (this would be a practical part of the proposed Dual Hub realignment of the Red Line).

High-speed rail for the Midwest

A convenient, comfortable, economical high-speed rail network could be operating in the Midwest by the year 2000, according to a proposal by the Environmental Law and Policy Center of the Midwest. Initially, the network would be centered on Chicago, with lines running to Detroit, St. Louis and Milwaukee. State-of-the-art trains could operate at 100-125 miles per hour on existing track.

Total capital costs would be $1.2 billion. About $400 million of that would be covered by fare box revenues, another $400 million would come from the federal government and the rest would come from state, local and private funds.

When compared to the costs of highways and airports, a $400 million federal contribution is quite reasonable, says Howard Learner, executive director of the law and policy center. "It would cost more to widen I-94 between Detroit and Chicago than to do rail. And adding highway lanes would increase air pollution."

In addition to helping clean the air, high-speed rail would stimulate job growth and the redevelopment of central cities, promote tourism, and encourage more compact and efficient land use patterns. It is an opportunity to achieve both environmental quality and economic development.

The Midwest is the logical place for a high-speed rail network, Learner adds. It is the traditional hub of the nation’s transportation system. And major cities in the Midwest are close enough together (within 350 miles) so that door-to-door travel times between downtowns will be competitive with air travel.

For more information, contact the center at 203 North LaSalle St., Suite 1390, Chicago, IL 60601, (312) 759-3400.
In the news

- Cars vs. cows: The Plain Dealer recently did a nice, but sad, piece on how suburban sprawl and traffic are moving toward farms in southern Medina County. One farm was forced out of the dairy business because of high insurance premiums to cover the possibility that their cows might wander out on the road and cause a traffic accident. Another farmer lamented, "We're only a little ways out of the rat race. It'll keep moving further this way." (Back in September, the PD's Jim Nichols wrote an excellent feature story summarizing growth pressures in Medina County.)

- Snowed under: Many townships and villages in the area are in no position to deal with the development pressures being thrust upon them. They can't even handle all the paperwork, much less plan for their future in an orderly way. Sheffield Village, for example, almost defaulted on a $500,000 note for sewer improvements recently because the note was lost on papers on the clerk-treasurer's desk.

- What's wrong with this picture? The PD's coverage of regional development trends is often schizophrenic—covering how communities are struggling to cope with growth pressures or outmigration in the Metro section of the paper, while celebrating new subdivisions in the Real Estate section. One disturbing Real Estate story recently advised homebuyers how to "find the right spot to build your dream home in a rural area." It pictured the owner of a new home in Medina County sitting proudly on his riding lawn mower. Apparently, the guy didn't see anything wrong with maintaining acres of unecological lawn and commuting 40 miles to work.

Dangerous GATT?

Leaders of the environmental and labor movements are concerned that the new world trade agreement, the General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade (GATT), will undermine hard-won protections for the environment and public health. Nearly 1,200 unionist and environmentalists packed the United Auto Workers Local 1005 Hall in Parma Saturday to hear Ralph Nader call GATT an "undermining give-away to multinational corporations.

The most dangerous aspect of the agreement, Nader said, is its secret tribunal that can overturn U.S. labor, environmental laws or consumer rights as "obstacles to trade." For more information, contact the Consumer-Labor-Environmental Coalition to Stop GATT at 447-6080.

1994 eagle report

The Ohio Division of Wildlife reports the state had another good breeding season for bald eagles in 1994. Ohio's 26 breeding pairs of eagles produced 30 eaglets. Most of the birds nest near the marshes at the western end of Lake Erie. But there were also active nests in Geauga, Portage and Mahoning counties in Northeast Ohio.

There are now about 4,000 pairs of bald eagles in the lower 48 states, up from 413 pairs in the early 1960s. As a result, the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service has recommended downgrading the eagle's federal status from "endangered" to "threatened" in much of the country. In Ohio, bald eagles will still retain their state designated status of endangered.

Biologists are keeping close watch on the Ohio birds to see if PCB contamination in western Lake Erie will affect their reproduction.

Bike planning

The Northeast

Ohio Areawide Coordinating Agency is starting to devote more staff time to bicycle planning. The agency recently hired an intern to focus on bike issues and promote bicycling as an alternative to single-occupancy automobile use. Comments and suggestions can be directed to NOACA Bicycle Planner, 668 Euclid Ave., Suite 400, Cleveland, OH 44114, or call 216-241-34, ext. 275.

Sierra Club staff

Glenn Landers, long-time activist with the Blackbrook Audubon chapter in Lake County, has been hired as an organizer for the Sierra Club's Clean Steel Project. He will be based in Northeast Ohio, with offices at 2460 Fairmount Blvd., Suite 307, in Cleveland Heights (791-9110). Sharing the office is the Ohio Public Interest Research Group, which is managing a joint door-to-door canvassing operation with the Sierra Club to recruit members and do public education. Ohio PIRG's number is 791-1116.

Global Resource Center on-line

The Global Issues Resource Center (formerly the Nuclear Age Resource Center) has placed information about its extensive library holdings on the electronic CLEVENET catalog used by the Cleveland Public Library and other area libraries. Now you can request materials on-line by visiting your local library or by calling the system with a home computer.

The resource center has materials on arms control, nuclear waste, energy issues, conflict resolution, as well as other environmental issues. It is located on the Eastern Campus of Cuyahoga Community College. Call 987-2224 for details.

Pressure points

- I-717 median: People have watched sadly as the wide, wooded median of I-717 has been turned into four new high-speed lanes in recent months. Now Willoughby Hills residents are worried that stormwater running off the new pavement is exacerbating flooding in the Chagrin River and tributaries of Euclid Creek. The two watersheds have been altered dramatically by the highway and many other developments.

- Turnpike interchange: Residents of Brownhelm Twp. in western Lorain County are still fighting the Ohio Turnpike Commission's plans for a new interchange at Baumhart Road. Lorain County politicians hope the interchange will bring economic development. The residents just foresee traffic, noise and the loss of their rural way of life.

- Firestone estate: It's not often that a 1,500-acre tract of undeveloped land goes up for sale in northeast Ohio. So it's understandable that folks are getting worked up over the fate of the Raymond Firestone estate in Bath Twp. Firestone, the former head of the Firestone Rubber Co., died in September and left the land to Ohio State University for $5 million.

University trustees are now talking about developing the estate at a profit. But a grassroots group, Bath Open Spaces, is organizing to preserve the land for recreational uses. For more information, call Paul Meyer at 869-6701, or Wesley Lemanon at 659-4219.

- Mentor Lagoons: One of the best places on the Ohio lakefront—the Mentor Lagoons and adjacent forest, swamp and beach areas—remains in limbo while public officials debate whether to buy the 400-acre site or let it fall to developers. Citizens are encouraged to keep writing to Governor George Voinovich and Mentor Mayor James Struna and urge them to save this unique resource.

- Another opening for sprawl: The mayors of Avon and Avon Lake are pushing the Ohio Department of Transportation to get moving with the widening and relocation of Ohio 83 north of I-90. The new four-lane road would open up new land for industrial development. Mayors of western suburbs are also pushing for a new I-90 interchange between Ohio 83 and Crocker Road in Westlake.
Mt. Sinai cancels incinerator

Bowing to public pressure and growing concern over dioxin hazards, Mt. Sinai Medical Center in Cleveland has cancelled plans to install an incinerator to burn solid and medical waste. In a letter to Mayor Michael White dated November 23, hospital president Robert Shakno wrote, "The decision was made because we believe it is not in the best interest of either our community or Mt. Sinai to undertake this project if there are any doubts about the release of dioxins that might affect the health of our citizens."

Even at exceedingly small doses, dioxin has been linked to cancer, reproductive failure and other health problems. It is produced inadvertently when chlorine reacts with organic compounds during combustion or other industrial processes. Major sources of dioxin are municipal and hospital incinerators which burn plastics.

At a City Council hearing December 6, residents of the adjoining Hough and Glenville neighborhoods said they were happy about the cancellation but still angry that they were not notified about the incinerator until the permitting process was well underway. They also expressed concern that Mt. Sinai's continued shipments of medical waste to an incinerator near Dayton will export dioxin hazards to another community. And they urged Mt. Sinai to reduce its waste stream by returning to the days of metal bedpans when hospitals routinely sterilized equipment instead of throwing it away after use.

Chris Trepal of the Earth Day Coalition called for a moratorium on new incinerators in Cleveland, adding that the city's medical establishment should take the lead in developing waste reduction alternatives. She said that the city and local grassroots groups now need to focus attention on other dioxin emitters in the region—other hospitals such as the Cleveland Clinic and St. Vincent Charity and other industries that burn materials contaminated with chloroform.

Ethical investing

Want your investments to live up to your environmental and ethical ideals? Local Sierra Club member Fred Oswald has organized an Ethical Investors Club so people can work together to make wise investments and promote responsible corporate behavior.

The club's next meeting will be at 7 p.m. January 4 at the Berea Public Library. Call 888-3829 or 843-7272 for more information.

What's to like about Cleveland?

We skimmed curiously through the new pocket book, 336 Favorite Things About Cleveland, looking for signs that Clevelanders are impressed by our natural environment. Most listings in the book focus on urban pleasures (museums, bars, Jacob's Field, ethnic diversity, affordable housing), but a few appreciate our natural wonders.

Several respondents, for instance, praise our distinct seasons. According to Karen Gabay of the Cleveland Ballet, "Cleveland does Vivaldi's music proud. We have an authentic autumn, a wondrous winter, a spring and a summer." Others notice Lake Erie. The actor Hal Holbrook says, "The lake is a mesmerizing and beautiful body of water. To live in a city on water has always seemed to me an extra privilege." Plain Dealer Sunday Magazine editor Anne Gordon adds, "The roar of Lake Erie cresting against the cliffs during a winter storm. The power of the winds and waves holds me to nature even while I'm in the city."

Still others value our parks (Metroparks, Cuyahoga Valley National Recreation Area, Shaker Lakes). EcoCity Cleveland editor David Beach even got in a plug for the region's biological diversity, noting that we sit astride a fascinating biological and geological crossroads at the intersection of the lake plains, the glaciated Allegheny Plateau and the glaciated till plains.

The book was published recently by Gray & Co. Publishers of Cleveland.

Permits to pollute

Here are some Ohio EPA actions of interest from recent weeks. For complete and up-to-date lists of permit activities in your county, watch for weekly legal notices in your local newspaper. For more detailed information, call the Ohio EPA Northeast District Office in Twinsburg, 425-9171.

Water pollution

Cleveland, organic pretreatment system.
LTV Grand River Lime Plant, discharge to Grand River.
Ohio Brass Co., Wadsworth, discharge to tributary of River Styx.
BF Goodrich, Akron, discharge to Sweitzer Creek.
Elyria Foundry, Elyria, discharge to Black River.
Marathon Oil, Akron, discharge to Blue Pond.

Air pollution

Master Builders, Berea, polyurethane manufacturing.
Mika Metal Fabricating, Willoughby, heat cleaning oven.
Valve Finishing, Mentor, chrome plating.
Diamond Products, Elyria, five paint spray booths.
Mameco International, Cleveland, polyurethane sealant manufacturing.
Venture Lighting, Solon, arc tube pinch process.
Waco International, Parma, surface coating line.
BF Goodrich, Avon Lake, 33,000-gallon storage tank for 1,4-butanol.
PPG Industries, Strongsville, two powder coating lines.
Cuyahoga Road Products, Cleveland, asphalt plant at W. 150th St.

Hazardous waste

Gre-Co Metal Finishers, Cleveland, closure plan for container storage areas and tank farms.
North East Chemical, Cleveland, request for confidentiality upheld for customer identifying data.
Prototype Development, Valley View, closure plan for hazardous waste contaminated slopes and drum storage area.
Chemtron, Avon, closure plan for storage tanks.

Sewer code violations

Northeast Ohio Regional Sewer District

Aircraft Plating Corp., Cleveland, $30,000 fine for not pretreating wastewater and allowing corrosive discharge to damage sewer system.
Metal Processing Corp., Cleveland, $300 fine for not submitting self-monitoring report.
Winva Finishing, Cleveland, $500 fine for not submitting self-monitoring report.
C.T. Industries, Cleveland, $500 fine for not submitting self-monitoring report.
Research Oil Co., Cleveland, $3,524.89 fine for discharging improperly treated wastes.

Wetland (410) permits

Hearing January 9 on Ohio EPA denial of Gerald Berne's proposal to construct a sheetpile bulkhead and install 12 docks on the Chagrin River in Fairlawn.
Norman Strelka, Bay Village, Lake Erie.
Thomas Viets, Bay Village, Lake Erie.
Franklin and Marguerite Hrabak, Noveltv Twp., denial of permit for work in Spring Creek.
BIOREGIONAL CALENDAR

December 31
Family New Year's Eve Party at the Happy Days Visitor Center of the Cuyahoga Valley National Recreation Area, 8:30 p.m. to midnight. Night hikes, crafts for the kids, and songs with Alex Bevan. Call 650-4636.

January 2
Monthly meeting of the Northeast Ohio Greens, 7:30 p.m. at the home of David Ellison, 3118 Carroll Ave. in Cleveland. Call 631-0557.

January 7
Earth Day Coalition meeting for EarthFest volunteers, 11 a.m. at the Cleveland Metroparks Zoo auditorium. Call 281-6468.

January 12
Monthly meeting of the Friends of Shadow Lake, the indefatigable group fighting a proposal to expand the Cuyahoga Regional Landfill on Metroparks land in Solon, 7:30 p.m. at Solon Community Church, 33955 Sherbrook Dr. Call 439-2159.

January 14
General meeting of the Ohio Bicycle Federation, 3 p.m. near Columbus. For more information and directions, call the group's Northeast Ohio representative, Bill Trentel, at 228-8325.

January 15
Snowbelt Jubilee, an afternoon of horse-drawn sleigh rides, dog sled demonstrations, winter camping and other winter games. Noon to 4 p.m. at the Geauga Park District's Swine Creek Reservation in Middlefield.

January 19
Friends of the Black River will meet at 7 p.m. at Lorain County Metro Parks Carlisle Visitor Center. Call 322-4187 for details.

January 21-22
Winter Recreation Expo at the Cuyahoga Valley National Recreation Area's Happy Days Visitor Center and the Chalet Recreation Area of the Cleveland Metroparks Mill Stream Run Reservation. Demonstrations of snowshoeing, cross-country skiing, and winter camping. Call 524-1497 after January 1 for details.

January 22
"Remembering the Interurban Railway," a slide show by interurban enthusiast Cliff Noon, 2 p.m. at the Meyer Center in Big Creek Park, Geauga Park District. Call 285-2222 to register.

January 25
Models of Unity Conference on the "Impact of Prejudice on Today's Society," 8:30 a.m. to 4:15 p.m. at the Cleveland State University Convocation Center. Sponsored by CSU, Heights Community Congress and the Lake Erie Girl Scout Council. Registration fee $60. For more information, call 321-6775.

January 29
Meeting of the Lake Erie Alliance, the citizen's organization to protect the Lake Erie Basin, at 1 p.m. at a Cleveland-area location to be announced. Call 322-4087 for more information.

EarthSpirituality Center
Lorain County has a new facility for connecting to our bioregion, the EarthSpirituality Center, located on the grounds of the Oberlin Country Day Camp just west of Oberlin. The center's mission is to nurture spiritual awareness in our relationships—with others, ourselves, the earth and the divine. It's being developed by four members of the Sisters of the Humility of Mary, but it is open to people of all cultural and religious backgrounds.

Upcoming programs include a song circle on January 7, solitude days on January 7 and 22, a midwinter look at the bioregion on January 21 and discussion of deep ecology on January 28. A facilitated discussion of the video Canticle to the Cosmos will be offered on January 17, 24 and 31.

For more information about programs and fees, call the center at 322-8142.

Board meetings of regional agencies
Here are the regular, monthly meeting times of agencies that are shaping our region.
Call to confirm.
- Cleveland-Cuyahoga County Port Authority, 101 Erieside Ave. Cleveland, 241-8004. Friday of first full week at 10 a.m.
- Cleveland Metroparks, 4101 Fulton Parkway, Cleveland, 351-6300. Second and fourth Thursdays at 9 a.m.
- Cuyahoga County Planning Commission, 323 Lakeside Ave. West, Cleveland, 443-3700. Second Tuesday at 2 p.m.
- Greater Cleveland Regional Transit Authority (RTA), State Office Building, 615 Superior Ave. NW, Cleveland, 566-5100. First and third Tuesdays at 9 a.m.
- Northeast Ohio Areawide Coordinating Agency (NOACA), 668 Euclid Ave., Cleveland, 241-2414. Board meeting second Friday at 9:30 a.m. Transportation Advisory Committee third Thursday at 10 a.m.
- Northeast Ohio Regional Sewer District, 3826 Euclid Ave., Cleveland, 881-6600. First and third Thursdays at 12:30 p.m.

Happy birthday, CVNRA!
The Cuyahoga Valley National Recreation Area, one of the region's best recreational assets, celebrates its 20th anniversary this month. It's a good time to thank the far-sighted individuals, such as former Congressman John Seiberling, who established the park and preserved invaluable open space between Cleveland and Akron.

EcoCity Cleveland © December 1994
Canals of Ohio

Canals formed Ohio’s first major transportation system. They opened up the state to commerce in the 1820s and 1830s. Then the railroads came through in the 1850s and gradually put canals out of business. Today, Ohio’s historic canals are being rediscovered and are becoming the routes for recreational trails. The prime example is the Ohio & Erie Canal, which has become the Towpath Trail between Cleveland and Akron.

Source: Canals of Ohio, 1825-1913, The Ohio Historical Society

Subscribe now!
Each month, EcoCity Cleveland will bring you the ideas and information you need to create a more sustainable bioregion.

Name ____________________________
Address __________________________
City _____________________________ State _____ Zip ______
Telephone _________________________
Bioregion (be creative)
  □ New or renewal regular one-year subscription—$20.
  □ Supporting subscription—$35 or more.
  [Tax-deductible contributions will help us reach more people.]
  □ Limited income—$15 (or whatever you can afford),
  □ Send me _____ free copies of EcoCity Cleveland to
  share with friends.

Please make checks payable to EcoCity Cleveland and mail to
2841 Scarborough Road, Cleveland Heights, OH 44118
Satisfaction guaranteed

EcoCity Cleveland
2841 Scarborough Road
Cleveland Heights, OH 44118
Cuyahoga Bioregion
(216) 932-3007

FORWARDING AND RETURN
POSTAGE GUARANTEED
ADDRESS CORRECTION REQUESTED
DATED MATERIAL — DO NOT DELAY

David Beach
2841 Scarborough Rd.
Cleveland Hts., OH 44118

❑ 100% Post-consumer waste

Time to renew your subscription? Check the expiration date on your mailing label.